

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY  
  
3 1761 10631478 4

Storage

KF  
9010  
A7  
S46  
1986  
v.2

Cases and materials on the law of  
remedies. Prelim. ed.

Storage  
KF  
9010  
A7  
S46  
1986  
v.2

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 23 1986

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASES AND MATERIALS  
ON  
REMEDIES

Volume II

Equitable Remedies

J. Berryman  
J. Cassels  
T. Cromwell  
D. Mullan  
S. Sadinsky  
R. Sharpe  
S. Waddams

September 1986

## Table of Contents

### Volume II Equitable Remedies

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Permanent Injunctions  |     |
| A. Introduction.....  | 473 |
| B. Quia Timet Injunctions.....                                      | 476 |
| <u>Fletcher v. Bealy</u> .....                                      | 477 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 483 |
| <u>Hooper v. Rodgers</u> .....                                      | 484 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 487 |
| C. Mandatory Injunctions.....                                       | 487 |
| <u>Redland Bricks v. Morris</u> .....                               | 488 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 492 |
| D. Injunctions to Protect Property Interests                        |     |
| i) Introduction.....  | 493 |
| ii) Trespass.....   | 494 |
| <u>Goodson v. Richardson</u> .....                                  | 495 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 498 |
| <u>Wollerton and Wilson Ltd. v. Richard Constain Ltd.</u> .....     | 501 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 505 |
| <u>John Trenberth Ltd. v. National Westminister Bank Ltd.</u> ..... | 508 |
| <u>Lewvest Ltd. v. Scotia Towers Ltd.</u> .....                     | 512 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 514 |
| <u>Post-Judgment Bargaining: Compensation or Extortion?</u> .....   | 516 |
| <u>Colls v. Home Colonial Stores Ltd.</u> .....                     | 516 |
| <u>Isenberg v. East India House Estate Co. Ltd.</u> .....           | 517 |
| iii) Alternatives to Injunctive Relief.....                         | 520 |
| iv) Nuisance.....   | 522 |
| <u>Miller v. Jackson</u> .....                                      | 523 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 531 |
| R.J. Sharpe, <u>Injunctions and Specific Performance</u> .....      | 532 |
| <u>Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co. Ltd.</u> .....                     | 538 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 543 |
| <u>Spur Industries Inc. v. Del E. Webb Development Co.</u> .....    | 546 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 550 |
| Domestic Violence in the Home.....                                  | 551 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| E. Criminal Equity: Injunctions to Protect Public Rights.....               | 552 |
| i) The Role of the Attorney General and the Courts.....                     | 552 |
| <u>Gouriet v. Union of Postal Workers</u> .....                             | 553 |
| <u>A.G. Alta v. Plantation Indoor Plants</u> .....                          | 556 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 561 |
| <u>Re British Columbia Government Employees' Union</u> .....                | 564 |
| <u>B.C. Labour Code ss. 31,32,73</u> .....                                  | 575 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 577 |
| <u>A.G.B.C. v. Couillard</u> .....  | 578 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 584 |
| <u>A.G.N.S. v. Beaver</u> .....   | 585 |
| ii) The Role of the Individual: Standing.....                               | 593 |
| <u>Gouriet v. Union of Postal Workers</u> .....                             | 594 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 598 |
| <u>Ex Parte Island Records Ltd.</u> .....                                   | 600 |
| 2. Interlocutory Injunctions  |     |
| A. Introduction.....  | 607 |
| i) Litigation Management.....   | 607 |
| ii) Balancing Interests.....  | 608 |
| iii) Judicial Administration.....   | 608 |
| B. Terminology.....   | 609 |
| C. Accessibility Thresholds and Irreparable Harm.....                       | 609 |
| G. Hammond, "Interlocutory Injunctions: Time for a New Model".....          | 610 |
| <u>American Cyanamid v. Ethicon</u> .....                                   | 612 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 618 |
| E. Gertner, <u>Studies in Civil Procedure</u> .....                         | 622 |
| <u>Yule Inc. v. Atlantic Pizza Delight Franchise</u> .....                  | 623 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 629 |
| <u>Cayne v. Global Natural Resources</u> .....                              | 633 |
| <u>C-Cure Chemical Co. Inc. v. Olympia and York Developments Ltd.</u> ..... | 633 |
| <u>Carlton Realty Co. Ltd. v. Maple Leaf Mills Ltd.</u> ....                | 634 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Irreparable Harm.....  | 635 |
| <u>Fiss, The Civil Rights Injunction.</u> .....  | 635 |
| <u>Hunt v. Board of Governors of Fanshawe College.</u> .....   | 636 |
| <u>Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto v. Danforth Hotel.</u> .....   | 640 |
| D. Undertakings.....   | 646 |
| Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure.....  | 646 |
| <u>Viewager Construction Co. v. Rush &amp; Thompkins Construction Ltd.</u> .....                               | 646 |
| Notes.....   | 648 |
| E. Ex Parte Applications.....  | 650 |
| Provincial Rules of Court.....   | 650 |
| <u>Griffin Steel Foundries Ltd. v. Canadian Association of Industrial, Mechanical and Allied Workers.</u> .... | 650 |
| F. Interlocutory Mandatory Injunction.....   | 652 |
| <u>Prairie Hospitality v. Renard Hospitality.</u> .....  | 652 |
| <u>Cantol Ltd. v. Brodi Chemicals Ltd.</u> .....   | 656 |
| <u>Steel Art Co. Ltd. v. Hrivnak.</u> .....  | 662 |
| G. Interlocutory Injunctions in Patent Action.....   | 665 |
| H. Interlocutory Injunctions in Labour Disputes.....   | 666 |
| <u>Arthurs, Carter and Glasbeek, Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada.</u> .....                      | 666 |
| <u>Courts of Justice Act.</u> .....  | 668 |
| <u>Blackstone Industrial Products Ltd. v. Parsons.</u> ....  | 669 |
| <u>Alex Henry &amp; Sons Ltd. v. Gale.</u> .....   | 672 |
| <u>Consolidated Bathurst Packaging Ltd. v. Canadian Paperworkers Union Local 343.</u> .....                    | 675 |
| Notes and Questions.....   | 678 |
| I. Interlocutory Injunctions in Defamation Actions....   | 679 |
| <u>Canada Metal Co. Ltd. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp.</u> .....  | 679 |
| <u>Canada Metal Co. Ltd. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. (No. 2).</u> .....                                     | 686 |
| <u>Canadian Tire Corp. Ltd. v. Desmond.</u> .....  | 687 |
| Notes.....   | 689 |
| J. Interlocutory Injunctions to Restrain the Disposition of Assets Pending Trial.....                          | 691 |
| (i) The Mareva Injunction.....   | 691 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <u>Mareva Compania Naviera S.A. v. International Bulkcarriers S.A.</u> .....                        | 691 |
| <u>Aetna Financial Services Ltd. v. Feigelman</u> .....   | 693 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 710 |
| Mareva Injunctions and Third Parties.....   | 711 |
| <u>Z Ltd. v. A-Z and AA-LL Ltd</u> .....  | 711 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 728 |
| An interesting use of a Mareva type injunction  |     |
| <u>West Mercia Constabulary v. Wagener</u> .....  | 730 |
| Notes.....  | 733 |
| (ii) Anton Piller Injunctions.....  | 735 |
| <u>Anton Piller K.G. v. Manufacturing Processes Ltd.</u> ..   | 735 |
| Berryman, "Anton Piller Orders: A Canadian Common Law Approach".....                                | 738 |
| Jurisdictional Base.....  | 740 |
| Procedural Safeguards and Related Problems.....   | 741 |
| <u>Bardeau (Ltd.) v. Crown Food Services Equipment Ltd.</u> .....                                   | 746 |
| Notes.....  | 747 |
| Paciocco, "Anton Piller Orders: Facing the Threat of the Privilege Against Self-incrimination"..... | 748 |
| Berryman, "Anton Piller Injunctions: An Update" ..  | 749 |
| 3. Specific Performance   |     |
| A. General Principles .....   | 751 |
| Farnsworth, "Legal Remedies for Breach of Contract".....  | 751 |
| A. Schwartz, "The Case for Specific Performance....   | 755 |
| Notes.....  | 758 |
| B. Sale of Goods and Chattels.....  | 759 |
| i) General  |     |
| <u>Falcke v. Gray</u> .....   | 759 |
| ii) Third Parties.....  | 762 |
| <u>Canadian Long Island v. Irving Industries</u> .....  | 763 |
| iii) Inadequacy of Consideration.....   | 765 |
| iv) The Sale of Goods Act and Replevin.....   | 766 |
| v) Long Term Contracts for the Supply of Goods or Services.....                                     | 770 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <u>Dominion Iron &amp; Steel Co. v. Dominion Coal Co.</u>            | 770 |
| Notes.....   | 775 |
| <u>Ryan v. Mutual Tontine Westminster Chambers Association</u> ..... | 776 |
| Notes.....   | 781 |
| <u>Tanenbaum v. W.J. Bell Paper Co. Ltd.</u> .....                   | 782 |
| Notes.....   | 789 |
| C. Personal Service Contracts.....                                   | 790 |
| <u>Giles &amp; Co. v. Morris</u> .....                               | 790 |
| Notes.....   | 794 |
| <u>Lumley v. Wagner</u> .....  | 795 |
| <u>Warner Bros. Pictures Incorporated v. Nelson</u> .....            | 796 |
| Milner's Cases and Materials on Contracts.....                       | 804 |
| <u>Detroit Football Co. v. Dublinski</u> .....                       | 809 |
| <u>Combines Investigation Act</u> .....                              | 811 |
| Standard Player Contract.....  | 812 |
| <u>Page One Records, Ltd. v. Britton</u> .....                       | 817 |
| <u>Hill v. C.A. Parsons &amp; Co. Ltd.</u> .....                     | 822 |
| Notes.....   | 831 |
| <u>Stevenson v. Air Canada</u> .....                                 | 835 |
| <u>Instone v. A Schroeder Music Publishing Co. Ltd.</u> ...          | 837 |
| <u>A Schroeder Music Publishing Co. Ltd. v. Macaulay</u> .....       | 840 |
| D. Land Contracts .....  | 844 |
| (i) General.....   | 844 |
| <u>McNabb v. Smith</u> .....   | 846 |
| <u>Bashir v. Koper</u> .....   | 848 |
| <u>Verrall v. Great Yarmouth Borough Council</u> ....                | 849 |
| (ii) Part Performance.....   | 852 |
| <u>Statute of Frauds</u> .....                                       | 852 |
| <u>Sale of Goods Act</u> .....                                       | 853 |
| <u>Maddison v. Alderson</u> .....                                    | 854 |
| <u>Rawlinson v. Ames</u> .....                                       | 862 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <u>Johnson v. The Canada Company</u> .....                                 | 864 |
| <u>Delgman v. Guaranty Trust Co. of Canada and Constantineau</u> .....     | 865 |
| <u>Thompson v. Guarantee Trust Co.</u> .....                               | 867 |
| <u>Lensen v. Lensen</u> .....  | 873 |
| <u>Toombs v. Mueller</u> .....   | 877 |
| (iii) Payment of Money.....  | 885 |
| <u>Starlite Variety Stores Ltd. v. Cloverlawn Investments Ltd.</u> .....   | 885 |
| <u>Currie v. Thomas</u> .....  | 886 |
| <u>Lavery v. Pursell</u> .....   | 890 |
| <u>Carter v. Irving Oil Co. Ltd</u> .....                                  | 892 |
| E. Discretionary Reasons for the Denial of Relief.....                     | 895 |
| i) "Equity Will Not Aid a Volunteer".....                                  | 895 |
| <u>Riches v. Burns</u> .....   | 896 |
| ii) Hardship.....  | 897 |
| <u>Patel v. Ali</u> .....  | 897 |
| iii) The "Clean Hands" Doctrine".....                                      | 900 |
| <u>Cerilli v. Klodt</u> .....  | 900 |
| iv) Lâches.....  | 901 |
| J.T. Farrand, "Speedy Performance".....                                    | 901 |
| <u>Grauer Estate v. Government of Canada</u> .....                         | 903 |
| <u>Kloepfer Wholesale Hardware &amp; Automotive Co. v. Roy</u> .....       | 904 |
| v) Mutuality.....  | 906 |
| Hanbury, <u>Modern Equity</u> (8th ed) at pp. 547-50.908                   |     |
| <u>Eastern Counties Railway Co. v. Hawkes</u> .....                        | 908 |
| <u>Price v. Strange</u> .....  | 909 |
| <u>Beswick v. Beswick (C.A.)</u> .....                                     | 923 |
| <u>Beswick v. Beswick (H.L.)</u> .....                                     | 924 |
| Waddams, <u>The Law of Damages</u> at pp. 316-18.....                      | 929 |
| <u>Waugh, Bowers, Davenport, Pollard et al. v. Slavik and Outhet</u> ..... | 930 |
| F. Specific Performance with an Abatement in the Purchase Price.....       | 931 |
| <u>Le Mesurier v. Andrus</u> .....   | 933 |



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson02unse>

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| G. | Election of Remedies.....   | 936 |
|    | <u>Johnson v. Agnew</u> .....   | 937 |
|    | <u>Dynamic Transport Ltd. v. O.K. Detailing Ltd</u> .....                                   | 943 |
|    | <u>Carma Developers v. Groveridge Imperial Properties</u> ..                                | 945 |
|    | <u>Beauchamp v. Coastal Corp. et. al</u> .....  | 949 |
| H. | Equitable Damages.....  | 953 |
|    | <u>Lord Cairns' Act, s.2</u> .....  | 953 |
|    | <u>J.A. Jolowicz, "Damages in Equity - A Study of Lord Cairns' Act"</u> .....               | 954 |
|    | <u>Judicatuce Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 223, s.21</u> .....                                      | 958 |
|    | <u>Courts of Justice Act, S.O. 1984, c.11, s.112</u> .....                                  | 958 |
|    | <u>Dobson v. Winton &amp; Robbins Ltd</u> .....   | 958 |
|    | <u>Price v. Strange</u> .....   | 962 |
| I. | Injunctions to Restrain Breaches of Contract.....   | 965 |
|    | <u>Doherty v. Allman and Dowden</u> .....   | 965 |
|    | <u>Fothergill v. Rowland</u> .....  | 970 |
|    | <u>Metropolitan Electric Supply Co. Limited v. Ginder</u> ..                                | 974 |
|    | <u>Thomas Borthwick &amp; Sons (Australasia) Ltd. v. South Otago Freezing Co. Ltd</u> ..... | 977 |
|    | <u>S.B.I. Management Ltd. v. Wabush (Carol) Co-Op Society Ltd</u> .....                     | 982 |
| J. | Remedy Stipulation.....   | 986 |
|    | <u>J.G. Collins Insurance Agencies Limited v. Elsley's Estate</u> .....                     | 986 |

## CHARTER REMEDIES

|    |   |      |
|----|---|------|
| A. | Introduction.....   | 994  |
| B. | Damages as a Charter Remedy.....                              | 1000 |
|    | <u>Crossman v. The Queen</u> .....                            | 1000 |
| C. | Injunctions as a Charter Remedy.....                          | 1003 |
|    | i) Injunctions and Crown Immunity.....                        | 1003 |
|    | <u>Van Mulligen v. Saskatchewan Housing Corporation</u> ..... | 1003 |
|    | ii) Interlocutory Injunctions.....                            | 1005 |
|    | <u>Re A.G. Canada and Gould</u> .....                         | 1005 |
|    | <u>Re Hardie and District of Summerland</u> .....             | 1009 |
|    | iii) Structural Injunctions.....                              | 1013 |
|    | Sharpe, "Injunctions and the Charter".....                    | 1013 |

